IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS FORT WORTH DIVISION

KASONIA L. CARTER,	§	
	§	
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	CIVIL ACTION NO.
V.	§	4:15-CV-00366-O
	§	
BURLINGTON NORTHERN SANTA	§	
FE, LLC, F/K/A BURLINGTON	§	
NORTHERN SANTA FE	§	
CORPORATION A/K/A	§	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL
BURLINGTON NORTHERN SANTA	§	
FE RAILWAY A/K/A BNSF,	§	
	§	
Defendant.	§	

APPENDIX IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SHOW CAUSE HEARING, CONTEMPT AND SANCTIONS FOR SPOLIATION OF EVIDENCE

COMES NOW, Defendant BNSF Railway Company incorrectly named as Burlington Northern Santa Fe, LLC, f/k/a Burlington Northern Santa Fe Corporation a/k/a Burlington Northern Santa Fe Railway a/k/a/ BNSF and files its Appendix in Support of its Motion for Show Cause Hearing, Contempt and Sanctions for Spoliation of Evidence.

EXHIBIT	<u>ITEM</u>	PAGE NO.
A	Declaration of Carolyn Ritchie dated December 18, 2015	App. 1-3
В	Excerpts from the Oral Deposition of Kasonia Carter taken on December 16, 2015	App. 4-18

TARONIA I GARGED

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Russell D. Cawyer

Russell D. Cawyer State Bar No. 00793482

Paige P. Biggs

State Bar No. 24037810

KELLY HART & HALLMAN LLP

201 Main Street, Suite 2500

Fort Worth, Texas 76102

Telephone: (817) 332-2500 Telecopy: (817) 878-9280

Email: russell.cawyer@kellyhart.com Email: paige.biggs@kellyhart.com

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

On December 18, 2015, I electronically submitted the foregoing document with the clerk of court for the U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas, using the electronic case filing system of the court. I hereby certify that I have served all counsel and/or pro se parties of record electronically or by another manner authorized by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5 (b)(2).

/s/ Russell D. Cawyer

Russell D. Cawyer

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS FORT WORTH DIVISION

KASONIA L. CARTER,	§	
	§	
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
V.	§	
	§	CIVIL ACTION NO.
BURLINGTON NORTHERN SANTA	§	4:15-CV-00366-O
FE, LLC, F/K/A BURLINGTON	§	
NORTHERN SANTA FE	§	
CORPORATION A/K/A	§	
BURLINGTON NORTHERN SANTA	§	
FE RAILWAY A/K/A BNSF,	§	
	§	
Defendant.	§	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL

DECLARATION OF CAROLYN RITCHIE

COUNTY OF TARRANT §

STATE OF TEXAS §



- 1. "My name is Carolyn Ritchie. I swear under the penalty of perjury that the following facts are true and correct and within my personal knowledge. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and have never been convicted of a felony."
 - 2. "I am a Senior General Attorney for BNSF Railway Company ('BNSF')."
- 3. "On December 16, 2015, I attended part of the deposition of Kasonia Carter at the Fort Worth offices of Kelly Hart & Hallman LLP. When I entered the conference room with BNSF's counsel for the commencement of the deposition of Kasonia Carter, Ms. Carter had a manila folder open in front of her that appeared to contain numerous pages of handwritten notes. The notes all appeared to be on white, lined paper. Some of the pieces of paper contained handwriting that was not in columnar list form, but rather written across the page in paragraph, narrative format.

- 4. "Before the deposition started, Russell Cawyer, BNSF's counsel, asked Carter and her lawyer to review the file folder and its notes. At one point during the colloquy between Plaintiff, her counsel, and Mr. Cawyer regarding the folder, Plaintiff or her counsel lifted the manila folder, which revealed that a copy of Plaintiff's complaint was lying underneath the manila folder. Plaintiff's counsel and Plaintiff refused Mr. Cawyer's request to review the file. Mr. McBeth then grabbed the folder, closed it, and placed it in or on Ms. Carter's black bag that was located on the floor behind her next to the wall. A copy of Ms. Carter's complaint was positioned beside or underneath the manila folder of handwritten notes. At all times I could see the folder and its contents while it was on the conference room table. Ms. Carter's copy of her complaint that she possessed at the deposition was not in the folder. The notes I observed were clearly not a copy of the complaint.
- 5. "During the deposition, Mr. McBeth and Ms. Carter represented that the folder had nothing to do with the lawsuit and merely contained personal information. Ms. Carter's counsel refused to allow BNSF's counsel to inspect the folder or its contents during the course of the deposition either on or off the record.
- 6. "Plaintiff's counsel repeatedly obstructed defense counsel's questioning of Plaintiff regarding the contents of the folder, refusing to allow Plaintiff to describe the contents of the folder, read the title written on the folder, or count the number of handwritten pages in the folder. The deposition transcript should reflect the questions that were asked and answers given by Ms. Carter about the contents of the folder. The court reporter, Gaylord Sturgess, was present in the conference room sitting next to Ms. Carter as she was reviewing the handwritten notes when I first entered the conference room. Mr. Sturgess was sitting approximately three feet from Ms. Carter. Mr. Sturgess was the only disinterested person in the room."

²⁰²³⁴²⁷_1 APP. 2

7. "About an hour into the deposition, Ms. Carter's counsel requested a break. Mr. McBeth left the conference room and Ms. Carter followed behind. After leaving the conference room with Mr. McBeth for less than a minute, Ms. Carter returned to the conference room and retrieved her bag containing the folder of handwritten notes. Once Ms. Carter left the deposition for the second time during the first break, I never saw the folder or the handwritten notes I had observed again. I did not attend the portion of the deposition where Ms. Carter turned the folder over to the court reporter, but I understand that the exchange occurred on the record."

8. "Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct."

Executed on December 18, 2015.

Carolyn Ritchie

Page 1 1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS 2 FORT WORTH DIVISION 3 KASONIA L. CARTER, 4 S Plaintiff S 5 S S CIVIL ACTION NO. v. 4:15-cv-00366-0 6 S BURLINGTON NORTHERN S 7 SANTA FE, LLC, F/K/A S **BURLINGTON NORTHERN** SANTA FE RAILWAY A/K/A 8 S BNSF, **EXHIBIT** 9 S Defendant S 10 11 EXCERPTS FROM THE ORAL DEPOSITION OF 12 KASONIA LINNELL CARTER Volume 1 of 1 13 December 16, 2015 14 EXCERPTS FROM THE ORAL DEPOSITION OF KASONIA 15 LINNELL CARTER, produced as a witness at the instance 16 17 of the Defendant, and duly sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered cause on December 16, 2015 18 from 10:12 AM to 4:44 PM, before Gaylord A. Sturgess, 19 CSR No. 744, in and for the State of Texas, reported 20 by Stenographic method, at the offices of KELLY HART & 21 HALLMAN, LLP, 201 Main Street, Suite 2500, Fort Worth, 22 23 Texas 76102, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the provisions stated on the record. 24 Job No. 2183334 25

	Page 2
1	APPEARANCES
2	FOR THE PLAINTIFF:
3	Hiram McBeth
	McBETH LAW OFFICE
4	6060 North Central Expressway, Suite 560
	Dallas, Texas 75206
5	972.498.8872
	hirammcbeth@hotmail.com
6	
7	FOR THE DEFENDANT:
8	Russell D. Cawyer
	KELLY HART & HALLMAN, LLP
9	201 Main Street, Suite 2500
	Fort Worth, Texas 76102
10	817.332.2500
	russell.cawyer@kellyhart.com
11 12	and:
13	
13	Carolyn Ritchie BNSF RAILWAY COMPANY
14	2500 Lou Menk Drive
T 4	AOB-3
15	Fort Worth, Texas 76131
	817.352.2365
16	carolyn.ritchie@bnsf.com
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Page 3 PROCEEDINGS 1 2 EXCERPT NO. 1: 3 4 THE REPORTER: Ms. Carter, would you raise your right hand, please, and be sworn. 5 Do you solemnly swear, or affirm, the 6 testimony you shall give in this case will be the 7 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so 8 9 help you God? 10 THE WITNESS: I do. 11 THE REPORTER: Thank you. 12 KASONIA LINNELL CARTER, 13 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows: 14 **EXAMINATION** BY MR. CAWYER: 15 16 What's your name? Q. 17 Kasonia Linnell Carter. Α. 18 Can you spell that for me? Q. 19 K-a-s-o-n-i-a, L-i-n-n-e-l-1, C-a-r-t-e-r. Α. 20 Have you ever had your deposition taken Q. 21 before? 22 Α. No. 23 0. I'm sure your lawyer has told you, but a 24 deposition is an opportunity for me to ask you 25 questions about your lawsuit and the claims you make

Page 4 1 against my client, BNSF Railway Company. Do you 2 understand that? 3 Α. Yes. And do you understand that before we began 4 0. your deposition, Mr. Sturgess placed you under oath? 5 6 Do you understand that? 7 Α. Yes. And do you understand that that's the same 8 0. 9 or a similar oath that you would be given if you were testifying in court, in a courthouse? 10 11 understand that? 12 Α. Yes. 13 You understand that the penalties for 0. 14 perjury and untruthfulness apply to the testimony that 15 you give here just as it would if we were down the 16 street in the federal courthouse? Do you understand 17 that? 18 Α. Yeah. 19 During the course of this deposition, 0. Okay. 20 if I ask you a question that you are unclear about or 21 you don't understand, would you stop me and ask me to repeat or rephrase my question? 22 23 Α. Yes. 24 Q. The reason that that's important, 25 Ms. Carter, is: If I ask you a question today and you

Page 5 1 give me an answer, I'm going to presume that you 2 understood my question. Would you agree that that 3 would be a fair presumption on my part? 4 Yes. 5 The other thing that you need to do is -- so 0. 6 far you've done very well, but we need to make sure 7 that you verbalize your answers. Sometimes we shake our heads yes or no in response to a question, or you 8 9 may say uh-huh or huh-uh. And if you do that, I'll 10 try to get you to verbalize your answer. I might put my hand to my ear, or I might ask you to clarify your 11 12 answer. 13 I don't mean any disrespect by that. 14 just want to make sure that Mr. Sturgess can take your 15 testimony down truthfully and accurately. Okay? 16 Α. Okay. When I walked into the deposition, you had a 17 Q. 18 manila folder with, it looked like, 30 or so pages of 19 handwritten notes. What were those notes? 20 A. Those notes were my personal business. Grocery list, things like that. 21 22 In any of those notes, were there any Q. 23 references to BNSF? 24 A. No. 25 Q. Were there any references to your employment

Page 6 1 with BNSF? 2 A. No. 3 0. Were there any references to the factual allegations that you make against my client in this 4 5 lawsuit? 6 Α. Say that again. 7 Were there any references to any of the Q. factual allegations that you make against my client in 8 9 this lawsuit? 10 Α. Can you rephrase? 11 What part --0. 12 I still don't understand. Α. 13 Q. What part do you not understand? 14 Well, can you repeat it again then? Α. 15 Q. Sure. 16 Mr. Sturgess, would you MR. CAWYER: read it back for her. 17 18 (Reading from his THE REPORTER: 19 notes): 20 Were there any references to any of the 21 factual allegations that you make 22 against my client in this lawsuit? 23 Factual, I mean, I don't understand. Α. 24 you asking me what's in my folder or --25 Q. Well, that's one of the questions I'm asking

Page 7 1 you. The stuff in my folder is personal business. 2 A. Well, what personal business? 3 0. Personal business of mine. Grocery lists, 4 A. 5 things like that, things for me to do. 6 0. Can you explain for the Court why you were studying your grocery list minutes before beginning 7 this deposition? 8 9 MR. MCBETH: Russell, I'm going to object. My client has indicated that what she has --10 11 What's your objection; MR. CAWYER: 12 what's your legal objection? 13 MR. MCBETH: My objection is about the She has indicated that what she has --14 questioning. 15 MR. CAWYER: Mr. McBeth, speaking --16 MR. MCBETH: -- has nothing to do with BNSF in this case, her own personal stuff and that's 17 And she's answered that. 18 19 BY MR. CAWYER: 20 Q. My question was -- so moments before we began this deposition, you had a manila folder with 21 about 30 pages of handwritten notes in front of you. 22 And it's your testimony here under oath that that was 23 24 your grocery list? 25 Α. Half of that list is the deposition, and

Page 8 1 that list consists of -- let's see. Well, 34, 35 --2 about 37 pages. So what you saw in the folder was --3 the majority of it was this deposition. Well, why don't you show me the folder, and 4 0. 5 if it's not related --6 MR. MCBETH: I'm not going to let her do that. We're not going to do that, Russell. 7 8 MR. CAWYER: Can I finish my question? 9 MR. MCBETH: You can finish it. 10 MR. CAWYER: Please don't interrupt me. MR. MCBETH: All right. Go ahead. 11 12 BY MR. CAWYER: 13 Why don't you show me those documents and 0. handwritten notes which you had in front of you when 14 15 we walked in to commence this deposition, and I'll look at those off the record. And if they don't have 16 anything to do with this lawsuit, then we'll move on. 17 18 Otherwise, then we're going to have to take this up 19 with Judge O'Connor, and just one more discovery 20 dispute which has been a continuation in this case. 21 MR. MCBETH: We're going to have to do that, Russell. 22 23 MR. CAWYER: Okay. I'm going to make 24 sure that you understand that I'm asking you to 25 preserve that manila folder and all of its contents

Page 9 1 exactly as it exists right now. Because when we finish this deposition, or at a break in this 2 deposition, we're going to be seeking appropriate 3 relief from the Court. Do you understand that? 4 5 I don't understand what you mean, Α. 6 appropriate relief from the Court. 7 Well, we're going to ask the Court to take Q. some action to force you to turn those notes over 8 9 or --10 Α. Well, I believe you have a copy of the -- of 11 the discovery already. 12 I'm not talking about your complaint or your Q. 13 discovery --14 Well, you said that there was about 30 to 35 Α. 15 pages, and this is about 37 pages. 16 Why don't you do this: Why don't you take 0. the manila folder out, why don't you count the number 17 18 of handwritten pages there are. You don't have to 19 show them to me right now. 20 MR. MCBETH: No, she's not going to do 21 that. 22 MR. CAWYER: Why? 23 What she had in there was MR. MCBETH: 24 her -- a copy of the Original Petition, which she has 25 now and which I told her that she could bring if you

```
Page 10
 1
     had no objection. That's what she's looking at.
 2
     That's what she had.
                           The rest is personal information
 3
     that she's not going to produce.
     BY MR. CAWYER:
 4
 5
               Okay. Read for me what's on the outside of
          Q.
     the manila folder that's --
 6
7
                    MR. MCBETH: She's not reading anything
8
     pertaining to what's on the outside of that folder.
9
                    MR. CAWYER: Hiram, let me finish my
10
     question.
11
                    MR. MCBETH:
                                 That was a question?
12
     Well, ask the question.
13
     BY MR. CAWYER:
14
               Ms. Carter, please get the manila folder out
          0.
15
     that you brought with you today and that contains
     these handwritten notes that you were reviewing before
16
     your deposition and read me what's written in black
17
18
     marker on the outside of that manila folder.
19
                    MR. MCBETH: She's not going to do
20
     that.
21
          0.
               Okay. Are you refusing to follow my
     request?
22
23
               I'm working through my attorney.
          A.
24
          Q.
               Well, so you're refusing to comply with my
25
     request?
```

Page 11 1 I'm working through my attorney. A. 2 Q. Next I'm going to ask you: Please count the number of handwritten pages that are in the manila 3 folder that you brought with you today and that you 4 5 had open before we went to commence this deposition. Well, you said it was between 30 and 35, so 6 A. 7 that was your speculation. I'm not sure. You're the witness, you're under oath, and 8 Q. 9 it's your testimony. And I'm asking you, would you please open the manila folder and count the number of 10 11 pages. 12 MR. MCBETH: No, she's not doing that. 13 Q. So you're refusing to comply with my 14 request? 15 A. Working through the advice of my attorney. Okay. What's your date of birth? 16 Q. 4-29-71. 17 A. 18 19 20 EXCERPT NO. 2: 21 22 MR. CAWYER: Mr. McBeth, I'm going to 23 hand you an Order that Judge O'Connor has entered, and 24 it is ordering that Ms. Carter immediately turn over 25 the manila folder and its contents in your possession

	Page 12
1	to the court reporter; and the court reporter will
2	submit the manila folder and the contents for
3	in-camera inspection to determine whether such records
4	contain relevant information or are reasonably
5	calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible
6	evidence. I'm going to ask that you turn that folder
7	and its contents over.
8	(Short pause.)
9	Where are the handwritten notes that
10	were in this folder when we began the deposition?
11	THE WITNESS: No handwritten notes.
12	Sorry.
13	MR. MCBETH: Was that in there?
14	THE WITNESS: No, no. I was just
15	making notes.
16	MR. MCBETH: Okay.
17	BY MR. CAWYER:
18	Q. Ms. Carter, what did you do with the balance
19	of the contents of this folder that, you have written
20	on the outside is K Carter versus BNSF?
21	A. I've always had that.
22	Q. My question was: Where were the handwritten
23	notes that were in this folder when we walked in to
24	begin this deposition?
25	A. That's what I had in there, plus my

	Page 13
1	complaint.
2	Q. We'll let Judge O'Connor take it up, but
3	this folder is K Carter versus BNSF. This is this
4	lawsuit, correct?
5	A. Correct.
6	MR. CAWYER: The record will reflect
7	I'm turning over a manila folder and a single page to
8	Mr. Sturgess.
9	MR. MCBETH: No, you're turning over
10	this also. This is part of it.
11	THE WITNESS: This and that piece of
12	paper right there.
13	MR. MCBETH: That's what's in there.
14	And she and all the records, the
15	records. And that document is the Original Petition,
16	file marked copy which I told Ms. Carter to bring to
17	this deposition for her convenience in case she was
18	asked about it.
19	Of course that duplicate has been
20	turned has been submitted as Depo Exhibit Number 1.
21	
22	(END OF EXCERPTS.)
23	
24	
25	

	Page 16
1	
2	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
3	FORT WORTH DIVISION
	KASONIA L. CARTER, §
4	S
	Plaintiff §
5	§
6	v. § CIVIL ACTION NO. § 4:15-cv-00366-0
0	BURLINGTON NORTHERN §
7	SANTA FE, LLC, F/K/A §
	BURLINGTON NORTHERN §
8	SANTA FE RAILWAY A/K/A §
	BNSF, §
9	§ Defendant §
10	Delendant
_0	
11	
12	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION
	EXCERPTS FROM THE DEPOSITION OF KASONIA LINNELL CARTER
13	Volume 1 of 1
14	December 16, 2015
17	
15	
	STATE OF TEXAS)
16	
17	I, Gaylord A. Sturgess, a Certified
18	Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of Texas, do
19 20	hereby certify that, pursuant to the agreement hereinbefore set forth, there came before me KASONIA
21	LINNELL CARTER, who was by me duly sworn to testify
22	the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth
23	of said witness's knowledge concerning the matters in
24	controversy in this cause; and the said witness was
25	thereupon carefully examined upon said oath, and said

Page 17 examination reduced to writing under my supervision; 1 2 that the deposition is a true record of the testimony given by said witness, same to be sworn to and 3 4 subscribed by said witness before any notary public, pursuant to the agreement of the parties. 5 I further certify that I am neither 6 7 counsel for nor related to any party in this cause and 8 am not financially interested in its outcome. 9 I further certify that the taxable cost 10 for preparation of the Original deposition transcript 11 and Original exhibits, if any, is \$ and was/will be paid by Defendant. 12 13 GIVEN UNDER MY HAND AND SEAL of office on December 16, 2015. 14 15 Sugard Storgen 16 GAYLORD A. STURGESS, CSR No. 744 17 Expiration Date: 12.31.16 VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS 18 Veritext Registration No. 571 19 300 Throckmorton Street Suite 1600 20 Fort Worth, Texas 76102 817.336.3042 800.336.4000 21 Job No. 2183334 22 23 24 25